## Program JUST/2015/RDIS/AG/DISC/9507

## «Tackling multiple discrimination in Greece:

## Delivering equality by active exploration and enabling policy interventions»

## Deliverable: 'Qualitative field research for multiple discrimination'
## Author: Despoina Grigoriadou

## National Social Research Center
## Athens, December 2017

This report has been produced within the framework of the project "Tackling multiple discrimination in Greece: Delivering equality by active exploration and enabling policy interventions", which is co - funded by the Rights, Equality and Citizenship (REC) Programme of the European. Its contents are the sole responsibility of the author and can in no way be taken to reflect the views of the European Commission.

# Table of contents

# Introduction

This deliverable entitled 'Qualitative field research for multiple discrimination'' is part of the implementation of the project 'Fighting multiple discrimination in Greece: Promoting equality through active participation and policy interventions'. The field research includes 36 interviews on the 6 project target groups and complements the quantitative survey with 500 questionnaires in the target groups and the pilot research of the situation testing.

In order to understand and to tackle multiple discrimination against the 6 target groups under investigation in Greece, we need to pay attention to the way that victims of multiple discrimination understand and give meaning to their own experiences and to the way that they respond to multiple discrimination behaviours. Moreover, since multiple discrimination is a sensitive issue, it needs careful handling and methodological tools that produce better results (Denscombe 2006:165). For that reason, a qualitative research strategy using interviews has been carried out in combination with both the survey research and the situation testing. The emphasis of the qualitative research is given on why and how (Denscombe 2006:267-268, Bryman 2008:373-374) multiple discrimination occurs, offering a more comprehensive and detailed understanding of attitudes and perceptions that can contribute to better designed policy solutions.

Apart from the need for a deeper and bottom up understanding of multiple discrimination, there is also a need for more and recent data from the field by all six groups. The phenomenon of multiple discrimination in Greece is under-investigated. There is no extensive research on multiple discrimination, much more applying qualitative research. Moreover, no official data exist regarding multiple discrimination. A common approach for analysing multiple discrimination in Greece, is to combine the discrimination data from the National Statistic Agency (ELSTAT) and the Eurobarometer (see for instance the report on the monitoring and assessment of women immigrants integration in Greece, ELIAMEP 2012) .

A bibliography research for the Greek case concludes that there are only very few reports that investigate multiple discrimination. In the country report of Homophobia in Greece for the Institute of Rights, Equality and Diversity (I-RED), there is a short

section about multiple discrimination (Pavlou, 2009: 27-28). The data are based on the activists' experience in supporting discrimination victims. Moreover, in the collective volume 'Racism and discrimination in Greece today' (2014), a short reference is made to multiple discrimination of all 6 groups, based on secondary references and on published articles in newspapers.

There are more data regarding multiple discrimination based on gender, mainly women, and other elements of otherness such as race or origin, disability and age. These studies examine multiple discrimination in the field of employment only. The National Centre for Social Research (EKKE) has realised a research regarding the access of young Roma in the economic sector based on quantitative and qualitative data (Tsiganou & Balourdos 2015). From a legal perspective, Kofinis (2016) investigates the occurrence of multiple discrimination in the Muslim minority women in Greece, while Magoulios & Trichopoulou (2012), collecting survey data, investigate the multiple discrimination of people with disabilities in relation to their access to labour market.

Although there is an increasing interest on the issues of multiple discrimination, especially at the EU level[1], the absence of systematic research is also evident in other EU countries. Many national and European statistics do not include data that simultaneously cover multiple areas of discrimination such as gender and ethnic origin or disability, which makes it difficult to study and monitor the phenomenon (Chopin, Farkas, Germaine 2014, Sheppard 2011:5-9). Therefore, the present qualitative research, in combination with the survey, seeks to fill this gap in Greek literature and to provide policy makers with ground-based and detailed evidence to improve their protection policies against multiple discrimination. It also seeks to acknowledge new grounds of discrimination such as the low socio-economic status and poverty, mainly during times of economic crisis, and, thus, to contribute to the wider scientific and social policy discussions on multiple discrimination in Europe.

---

[1]See mainly the reports of the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights(FRA)(Inequalities and multiple discrimination in healthcare, 2012 and Multiple Discrimination, 2010), as well as the"Multiple Discrimination in EU Law. Opportunities for legal responses to intersectional gender discrimination" (2009) report of the European Commission's Directorate General for Employment, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities.

.

## A. Types of multiple discrimination

Over the last two decades, the concept of multiple discrimination has become central to both social research and European and national policies. Although there are different theories about the concept and approaches of multiple discrimination, it is argued that in any case this concept focuses our attention on multiple inequalities as they have been developed at different levels within a society adding gradually cumulative disadvantages to one person(European network of legal experts in gender equality and non-discrimination, 2016). For example, a person who is discriminated against because of his or her national background may also be discriminated against on the ground of his/ her sex, sexual orientation, religion or belief, age or disability. Such discrimination may create an accumulative disadvantage.

Ethnic minority women, older women, black women and women with disabilities are among the most disadvantaged groups in many EU Member States. By the same, multiple discrimination exists for gay or lesbian ethnic minorities, black people with disabilities, younger members of ethnic minorities or older people, especially if they are homosexuals(European network of legal experts in gender equality and non-discrimination, 2016).

In particular, the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (2008) states that women and girls with disabilities are often at greater risk of violence, abuse and exploitation, and underlines that the majority of people with disabilities are living in poverty. Because women with disabilities experience greater discrimination not only with regard to women without disabilities but also in relation to men with disabilities, they also have limited access to the labour market, with the result that the risk of poverty is particularly high. In times of economic crisis, as in our days, women with disabilities and mothers of children with disabilities are the first victims of economic deprivation.

CEDAW (1979)for women argues that the discrimination faced by older women is multiple and is exacerbated by poverty, immigration, marital status and ethnicity. In addition, the EGGSI Panel of Experts (2008) argues that women from disadvantaged ethnic minorities, including Roma women, are at greater risk of social exclusion and poverty, both in comparison to the men of their communities and the men of the

general population. This is particularly true for access to employment, health, education and social services. Multiple discrimination is partly due to the interplay between unequal power relations within their communities and unequal power relations within the society.

According to FRA (2010), socio-economic status is a key factor contributing to the creation of a further field of discrimination among ethnic minorities or immigrants, with 46% of low-income respondents stating that they face multiple discrimination. Disadvantaged ethnic minorities tend to live in separate, low-income neighbourhoods with inadequate access to public transport and social services. They are often discriminated against in the housing market, pay higher rents and not having rental contracts. This is particularly obvious in the case of illegal immigrants.

Also in the same study, age is a field that transcends other grounds such as origin, sexual orientation and disability. One in four respondents from ethnic minorities or immigrants said they were victims of discrimination in at least two fields. In particular, young people in the above categories reported high levels of discrimination due to their origin.

Regarding the ways in which multiple discrimination can occur, the literature(European network of legal experts in gender equality and non-discrimination 2016) identifies three types:

A. The first is about the individual who experiences discrimination in different grounds and at different times. This type of multiple discrimination is commonly referred in the literature as cumulative. For example, an individual from a minority ethnic group with disabilities may be one time discriminated against his/her ethnic origin and another time because of his/her disability.

B. The second concerns a person who is discriminated against for different reasons but at the same time. This type of multiple discrimination is referred to as an additive since each ground of discrimination can be identified separately. For example, a young Muslim can be discriminated against for his age and his religious beliefs

C. The third relates to a person who is discriminated against not as a result of two distinct grounds of discrimination but as the combination of both, which create a new

source of discrimination. For example, black women may be discriminated against in a way that is qualitatively different from their two distinct features, sex and color. In particular, a black woman, although having common elements in her discrimination with a white woman or a black man, receives a different kind of multiple discrimination than a black man or a white woman. A white woman can be discriminated against because of her sex, but she can alsohave a racist behaviour against a black woman. A black man can be discriminated against his colour buthe can also discriminate a black woman as a result of sex. This kind of multiple discrimination is referred to as intersectional discrimination.The latter case of multiple discrimination is the most difficult to be detected both by the victims of discrimination and by the state in order to be able to deal with these categories of citizens with targeted policies.

In the study of multiple discrimination, each individual's particular features as well as the economic and social status are of great importance as they affect the way in which multiple discrimination takes place. Individuals of a particular identity are not homogeneous internally but there are big differences. Women, for example, face gender discrimination in different areas such as work, family, etc. But the extent and the way they experience discrimination vary according to their class, race, ethnicity, sexual orientation, age, religion and disability. This issue has been addressed by feminism since the early days of its ideological development when middle-class white feminists were rightly criticized by black women that their own experience was a universal feature of gender-based oppression without including in this way the characteristics of black women (European network of legal experts in gender equality and non-discrimination 2016).

Finally, for the study of multiple discrimination, we must take into account the power relations existing in a society and the way in which society defines the minority groups, constructing their identity, and then excluding or embedding them. However, these relationships can work vertically but also diagonally. For example, black men are in power over their sex, but not in relation to their color. White women, conversely, are in a position of power in relation to their color, but not to their sex. This demonstrates that the structures of sovereignty operate in complex ways, which cannot easily be gathered through the single identity model, but instead through the multiple discrimination model.

In the bibliographic review, the identification of the causes of multiple discrimination occurs primarily and mainly through the general causes of discrimination. Prejudices and stereotypes are cited in the literature as the main causes of discrimination. Several studies now refer to the "institutionalization of discrimination" as a key discriminating factor, for example, in the health sector. Discrimination becomes institutionalized when public services are offered in a way that assumes that all the users have the same characteristics as the majority population(European Commission2008).

For the needs of the qualitative research, the term "multiple discrimination" is used in its broadest sense to encompass cumulative, additive and intersectional discrimination. However, when the field provide relevant data, different types of multiple discrimination are identified and analysed.

## B. Interviews methodology

For the qualitative research, thirty-six interviews had been conducted, six interviews for each project's six target groups. All interviewees had at least two distinctive features resulting from six categories: age, gender, religion, race, national origin, disability. Attica was the geographical area chosen for the facilitation of the field research, since a bigger percentage of these groups can be found in this region. The duration of the interviews was one hour in average and took place either through Skype or face-to-face. All interviews and data analysis were carried out by the author of this chapter during the period from 1-1-2017 to 30-08-2017. Thirty-two of the thirty-six interviews were recorded and all the recorded interviews were transcribed.

As mentioned above, due to the lack of general data on multiple discrimination affecting the six groups, the interviews focused on an open-ended list of areas, where discrimination may take place in people's lives. The research focused not only on their personal experiences of discrimination on a single ground, but also on multiple grounds. In addition, interviewees themselves are required to refer to the way in which their peers were more likely to be multiple discriminated.

The interview questions aimed at highlighting and describing multiple discrimination in the six target groups, detecting cases of intersectional discrimination. Based on the

perceptions and experiences of the interviewees, the research focused on identifying the main reasons and behaviours that lead to multiple discrimination, awareness of their rights, the way that the victims of multiple discrimination respond and the solutions they propose in order to tackle multiple discrimination. Emphasis was placed on linking multiple discrimination with poverty and unemployment, on the identification of new vulnerable groups, as well as on changes in the way multiple discrimination is manifested after the economic and social crisis in Greece. Finally, since multiple discrimination may have different manifestations (cumulative, additive, intersectional), the research followed a progressive path from discrimination on a single ground in different circumstances, to additive and then to intersectional discrimination.

Due to the sensitivity of the issues of discrimination and the difficulties of access to the field, the selection of interviewees was based on the snowball method and on mediators who are working in the field of rights protection of the research target groups. One main research problem was to identify interviewees from the target groups, who at the same time had several features that could constitute the grounds of discriminatory behaviour. Due to the particularities of these groups, there was a great deal of difficulty in tracing the interviewees, in making them feel safe about the research and in allowing themselves to speak deliberatively. This process was particularly hard with transsexuals, immigrants and Roma women. The starting point was contact with their respective organisations, such as immigrants' organisations, homeless home centres and intercultural schools. All the above organisations were used as mediators, in order to trace individuals confident enough to trust the process of the interview. After the first ten persons had been identified, they recommended other persons for an interview and so the list was completed.

A second problem was the place where the interview would take place. People with disabilities had great difficulty in getting out of their home, s. many interviews were carried out through Skype. Also, due to their limited time and the desire of many interviewees to have an as informal interview as possible, some meetings were held at a neighbourhood quiet cafe. The advantage of these places was that the interviewees felt more relaxed with the whole process and that they could speak freely, to the point that most of them allowed the interview to be recorded.

A third serious difficulty was that the interviewees in many cases were not aware that they were victims of (multiple) discrimination. Their vulnerable economic and social status, their psychological exhaustion, their limited understanding of how the Greek system and language operate did not allow them to sense that they were being discriminated, seeing it as a normal everyday situation rather than discrimination. As a result, in some cases, towards the end of the interview, after explaining what multiple discrimination is, the interviewees began to describe cases that they had faced discrimination.

As interviews involved vulnerable population groups, attention was paid to the ethical issues of the research. The ethics of an interview, and in particular the issues of voluntary participation, consensus and confidentiality of anonymity, were strictly and foremost protected.

## C. Key findings

This section includes the key findings of the qualitative research. It is structured in 5 main sub-sections: the Greek context in which discrimination and multiple discrimination occur, the groups that are vulnerable to multiple discrimination, the spheres of life where multiple discrimination is expressed, the effects on their individual life and their responses.

### C.1 The context in which multiple discrimination occurs

Greece is a conservative religious society that resists to diversity. According to the Pew Research Centre (2016), Greece is first (63%) in the list of 10 EU countries that say that increasing diversity makes their countries worse places to live in, while half of the population (54%) believes that religion is very important to the Greek identity.

During the last decade, Greece faces increased racist violence, especially after the rise of Golden Dawn and the large inflow of refugees, mainly from Syria. At the same time, the situation of the Roma people in Greece is characterized by social exclusion and deprivation, illegal immigrants are living in a state of poverty, and homosexuals, and particularly transsexuals, face severe discrimination (ECRI 2015).

Despite the recent adoption of equal treatment and anti-discrimination laws (i.e: law 3896/2010 on equal opportunities for men and women, law 4356/2015 on civil partnership, law 4443/2016 on discrimination, law 4491/2017 on the legal recognition of gender identity, law 4538/2018 on fostering and adoption), multiple discrimination is still very resistant. For example, the Special Eurobarometer of 2015, exploring discrimination perceptions in the EU countries, states that 70% of the respondents consider that discrimination relative to ethnic origin in Greece is widespread with the corresponding figure in EU-28 varying around 64%. Moreover, regarding discrimination relative to sexual orientation, 71% of the Greek respondents answer that this is very widespread, while in EU-28 the relevant percentage is 58%.

## C.2 Who is vulnerable to multiple discrimination?

The interviews showed that all target groups were discriminated and treated unequally in relation to the majority of the population in Greek society. As it is reported in an interview by a young man with disability "since I became disabled, I have experienced all forms of discrimination and racism, whether it concerns my access to the urban environment, my personal relationships or work".

However, the combination of specific features of people in these groups creates a grid that makes them more vulnerable to multiple discrimination. In many cases, their unequal treatment by the state and society leads these groups to poverty and unemployment, being the very first victims of the economic deprivation resulting from the crisis. The groups that were identified in this field research are the following:

- **Older women**

Women aged over 35-40 years old are particularly discriminated in the workplace, and it appears that it is extremely difficult for them to find a job. The interviews revealed that the incidences of unequal treatment in the workplace resulted mainly from the economic crisis of the recent years which caused a limited job offer. If they finally manage to find a job, it is usually part time, illegal, and with flexible and undefined working hours. A middle aged woman immigrant states: "When we were looking for a job, usually as housekeepers, they asked about our age. If we revealed the real one, 57 years old, they told us that we had to be at least between 30 and 50 years old, in order to take the job''. Older women immigrants, over 60 years old, are

in the most difficult position, since they have been working for years in unreported jobs with low wages leading them to absolute poverty and exclusion.

- **Women with disabilities**

Women with disabilities are extensively discriminated initially at work, but also in their personal and family environment. Their level of education is usually low, because their families do not support them to complete their studies, which in turn does not allow them to look for a job. Women with disabilities are "hidden" by the family, they directly depend on it, they are socially isolated in a sheltered environment and they fail to create a family of their own. A middle aged man with disabilities says about women with disabilities: "They have many more difficulties than men to face, and they are not accepted by the society. I know many women who had been abandoned by their husbands when they were in a state of disability or who have never been able to find a job". As reported in all the interviews with women with disabilities, the difficulty for them to make their own family and find a job makes them fully dependent on their parents' family and on the insufficient state pension, and, as a result, they are more likely to experience poverty and exclusion in the future.

But even when a woman with disability finally finds a job, she is treated unequally. It becomes clear from the interviews that employers do not consider these women capable of undertaking a job corresponding to their abilities, or he/she feels they have done a favour to them offering that job, which in turn makes them feel underestimated. Even in terms of provision of services, such as medical, social or banking, women often face an aggressive or undignified behaviour. For example, as an old blind woman reports: "I went to a doctor once ... He looked at me and instead of talking to me, he turned to my mother. Some doctors treat us very badly, like we don't understand what they tell us".

- **People of other nationalities with disabilities**

People of other nationalities with disabilities in Greece are discriminated against by their own national community, as well as by the wider society, especially in the field of work and in their relations with the state. Nationality combined with disability leads to double discrimination. A man with disability states about immigrants with disabilities that "Society is much more racist to them; they are much more targeted and stigmatized. In some cases, it has been reported that these two features operate

intersectionally, while in other cases they function in succession. In any case, they face multiple discrimination and this is also manifested both in the public space and in public services. Characteristically, one interviewee refers to his friend, who is an Albanian with disability: "The social environment had difficulty accepting him, first because he is Albanian and second, because he has a disability", and he continues saying that even public servants adopt this attitude: "He suffered both psychologically and physically when trying to obtain a permit for a store by the State; it was as if he had to climb a mountain without legs". It was also reported by immigrant interviewees with disability that some national communities such as Syrian and Pakistani, they themselves marginalized people with disabilities, hiding them, because they have, like the Greeks, prejudices against people with disabilities.

- **Immigrant women, women from the Muslim minority and Roma women:** These women experience triple discrimination, as women against the men of their national community, as women against women of the wider population, and at the same time as people of another ethnicity towards the Greek population. Discrimination is encountered primarily in work (labour exploitation), but also in public space and services, as well as in their private life.

During the interviews, immigrant women very often mentioned the following:

- Sexual harassment in the workplace, as well as in the public space. Immigrant women working as housekeepers are particularly vulnerable. The rationale behind this harassment is that the employer knows that this woman is foreign, unprotected, poor, in many cases with children, "so you need me, and you will do what I want" as an old black woman reported from her experience. As a young Albanian woman characteristically mentioned "they took advantage of my weakness. That is, you work here, you need me, I have you in my hands, you live as it is or leave, you will have a good time here only if you accept what I tell you".

- Working illegally without social security, being paid less than the agreed wage, working overtime, under poor working conditions, having limited access to social services and high levels of unemployment. A Bulgarian woman complains about a job recruitment office: "It was like you were undressed in front of them, giving details of your life and realizing that you were alone, so they said now they can do what they want with me, they were trying to grab money... it was extreme exploitation". The situation is

even worse when it comes to immigrant women without a residence permit (irregular immigration).

Since immigrant women offer more often housekeeping services, their employers are mainly women. Therefore, multiple discrimination stems from Greek women, who consider themselves to be superior to immigrant women. Finally, immigrant women also face discrimination from male immigrants. As an Albanian woman states: "All these years immigrant women were in the shadow of their men... Women had the burden of the whole family, worked very hard, but they did not exist... They were neither officially registered, nor did they dare to get a divorce when the situation was difficult...". Working has helped these women to be a little self-sufficient, but the changes are quite limited, and immigrant women are still dependent on their husbands.

Roma women and Muslim women are even more vulnerable; they are at the margins of the formal social organization and they are victims of prejudices both internally in their community and in the wider society. Socio-economic marginalization traps them in a vicious cycle of poverty and exclusion from various social activities and the labour market. In particular, Muslim women, like Roma women, are at the lowest level of social stratification, almost excluded from society. They usually have a low economic and educational level, they do not know the Greek language well, and, in the interviews, they have identified themselves as Turkish, which creates a bigger challenge for their integration. Social discrimination is particularly strong because of both their ethnic identification and religion.

The situation is similar for Roma women. In the interviews, too many incidents of discrimination were reported in schools, public services, courts, hospitals and with the Police. In all cases, no complaint was filed and the victims did not even react, because either they feared they would not find justice or they did not know they were discriminated. A Muslim woman reports in terms of the waysocial services behave towards them: "They think that we are weak and that we will not find justice, so they treat us badly and they don't care about us".

- **Second-generation young immigrants**

This group faces many incidences of discrimination in both the education system (school bullying) and the labour market, as well as in their interpersonal relationships. Although unemployment in Greece is particularly high among young people, it is clear from the interviews that unemployment in this group is even higher. The limited social networks, the language problems and the low educational level of immigrant parents "have been inherited" to their children These young second-generation immigrants do not have the necessary skills and knowledge to find a high-profile job.

This is reflected in the labour market with employers offering young immigrants cheap and hard work. A second-generation black Greek describes his own experience: "Once I told a customer my opinion about what he was buying, and the customer told me: "Who do you think you are to speak to me? We are not equals". He said that because of my colour and my age, and my employer froze and said nothing. It was a very difficult situation for me".

Moreover, second-generation immigrants also face discrimination in their interpersonal relationships, since mixed couples are still a taboo in Greek society. Not only immigrants may not be accepted by their companion, when they discover their nationality, but there may also be reactions from their partner's family. An anecdotal story is presented by an Albanian woman: "Two young Albanians, who did not know that the other one was also from Albania, met and fell in love…, and they were both thinking 'How I will tell him/her now that I am Albanian? He/she may leave me'".

- **Homosexuals of another nationality**

If homophobia is particularly strong in the Greek society, it becomes even stronger when it comes to homosexuals of another nationality. Discrimination arises not only from the wider society, but at the same time from the national community to which the homosexual person belongs. In particular, members of ethnic minorities are likely to be discriminated against because of their different sexual orientation within their ethnic or national community, and on the grounds of race or ethnicity in the LGBT community, and, last but not least, because of both these characteristics in the wider society. A Greek gay person reports: "Albanian gay people face a huge problem of racism not only by the Greeks, but also by the Albanians. You cannot imagine. For Greeks, it is that he is Albanian, his main identity. For Albanians, however, it is far worse to be Albanian gay. The belittlement that an Albanian gay person may face

from the rest of the Albanians is much greater than what he may face from the Greeks because of being Albanian".

Discrimination mainly occurs first on the ground of nationality, especially in cases where it is visible, and then on the ground of sexual orientation, which may not be visible. A young black homosexual mentions "Discrimination did not occur at the same time on both grounds, as I look black (...) and so this will be the first thing that others will see. That is, if I want to become a friend with someone, colour is the first thing that will prevail at the beginning and some comments could be made from others on this…. Sexual orientation becomes an issue when I have to tell that to my friends; I have lost friends because of that…".

- **Transsexuals**

Different gender identity causes not only serious discrimination in private and public life of the Greek society, but also violent behaviours and hate speech even leading to racist crimes. Interviews from transsexual people have revealed that they face serious discrimination incidents at work, medical care and social services. In the public space, they face sexual insults, hostile behaviours and intense looks, mainly due to the expression of their gender identity rather than their sexual orientation. Particularly health and work issues are at the cutting edge of the problem, followed by the public space and the family/friendly environment. Transsexual interviewees very often referred to their anxiety to "pass" as men or women so that they are not perceived by the social environment as being different. Transsexual people may experience harassment and discrimination from managers and co-workers such as less favorable terms and conditions, fewer opportunities for promotion and training or dismissal. In many cases they live a double life. As a transsexual reports: "At work, I present myself as a man, while in my social and private life as a woman, and this way I avoid discrimination and humiliation at work. All this causes me a lot of anxiety; I have to hide every day, because I am afraid that I will lose my job".

In conclusion, from all the above, we could support that gender in principle, followed by nationality and age, play a significant role in the extent to which a person will face multiple discrimination from his or her environment. The interviews revealed that different religion does not play a catalytic role as a single ground of discrimination, but it triggers and enhances multiple discrimination in conjunction with other

grounds, such as nationality. Finally, different gender identity causes intense discrimination and distracting behaviours.

It is made clear from the interviews that class issues are important to the level and the extent of multiple discrimination manifestations. The high socio-economic situation of an individual plays a significant role in limiting the incidences of discrimination and to a large extent to the effective response of its impacts. All interviews remark that the financial position of the target groups plays an important role for their social acceptance. If for people with disabilities financial well-being allows for better accessibility and a better level of health and through them social inclusion, for immigrants and LGBT persons it directly allows social acceptance in the work environment and the social environment. For example, a Pakistani immigrant entrepreneur argues that there are two major categories of Pakistani people: entrepreneurs, who are accepted by society, themselves and their children, and simple workers, who provoke the wrath of the Greeks and who apart from discrimination, also face racist violence without ever reporting it. However, "at the end of the day, there is a dark point of separation between the Greeks and immigrants".

The class features of discrimination are clearly shown in the following reference in which an immigrant woman criticizes the practices of illegal work: "It is not just the Greeks who do this, but also immigrants have learned these tricks. If we think in a clever way, we will understand that the point is not whether you are Greek or Bulgarian –but whether you are the boss or the worker– money makes the world go round",while a gay man reports that "the LGBT community in Greece has racist features; it is a rather bourgeois community. A poor Pakistani gay man is not easily accepted… he has no place there".

Moreover, poverty itself appeared to be a new ground of discrimination, which in many cases overcomes the other grounds and it becomes the main source of discrimination. In most interviews, it is pointed out that there is a strong connection between poverty, unemployment and discrimination. The poorer a person is, without material and social resources, the more he/she could be subject to discriminative behaviours, which are difficult to overcome and to respond to. An immigrant man

states about this issue "When you are poor, regardless of nationality, society treats the same as it would treat a Greek poor person".

## C.3 Where does multiple discrimination occur?

The range and the size of discrimination vary between the groups, as well as the areas where discrimination take place. Immigrants, Roma people, ethnic minorities and transsexuals are discriminated in all areas (work/social environment, relation with the State, public space, personal/family relationships). People with disabilities and people with a different sexual orientation are more discriminated in specific areas such as work and accessibility for the first and public space and health care settings for the second.

Regarding public services, discrimination occurs very often, even in sectors like justice and the Police. A gay man mentions "The judge is a member of society and part of it, and, therefore, he is more biased towards Albanians, as for many years Albanians are associated in the public discourse with acts of delinquent behaviour. Therefore, there is a long distance between having good laws and implementing them". Regarding the health sector, a gay doctor expressed his racist ideology "Usually the poorest and those from the lowest social strata, those that have to do with religion are semi crazy, aren't they? Like the Roma people, we treat them equally, but we fret when we do that, we are very cautious".

It is reported in almost all the interviews that the behaviour of each civil servant depends on his/her personal attitude and willingness to support, or not, the target groups, rather than on the implementation of predetermined and specific behavioural rules towards vulnerable population groups. An immigrant woman reports that "The public sector is bureaucratic, but it is more bureaucratic for immigrants. Both for immigrants and for Greek people, the State is the employee, but it is easier for the employee to say to the immigrant "Leave... You do not have all the papers. Come back when you are ready" without thinking that at that moment he/she can obstruct the course of my life". Moreover, the issue of language is a serious obstacle to the provision of services to immigrants, since in many cases the public servant is not familiar with another language, so as to be able to serve the immigrant effectively.

Special attention must be given to the school environment regarding young immigrants and LGBT people. For instance, it is reported by LGBT people that, in schools calling someone gay is considered to be an insult and there is no an all children-embracing setting. As a result, young people feel that they have to hide their sexuality, because they may be victims of bulling by staff or classmates. The same happens to young immigrants and young Muslims of the Greek Muslims minority. A woman from the Muslim minority mentioned that she had quit school because "the kids were shouting at me 'Turkish, Turkish', and they were laughing at me", while her children had great difficulty getting integrated in school due to racist behaviours from their classmates.

Therefore, there is an imperative need for the familiarisation of public services with anti-discriminative service provisions, according to the more general legislative framework which guarantees the right of individuals to equal treatment and respect for diversity.

Regarding the work place, special attention must be paid to immigrant women and transsexuals. An immigrant woman reports: "After 25 years here, you may know everything, the language, history, but when the time comes to be integrated to the labour market, then discrimination starts…".

Visibility plays a major role in the manifestation of discrimination. People with a non-visible disability, homosexuals who do not demonstrate their different sexual orientation, immigrants from Albania or other Balkan countries, who have similar features to the Greeks, are less discriminated in public places, work, personal and social life than a wheelchair user, a blind person holding a walking stick or a black person. A blind woman reports: "I'm without a walking stick. If I hold a walking stick, they will see me more, they will look at me in a bad way... they will ask questions". Therefore, vulnerable people either try to hide certain characteristics (religion, sexual preference, nationality), or to pass as unnoticed as possible (semi-blind people do not hold sticks, immigrants do not turn to public services ...), so as not to "provoke" racist incidences and become victims of discrimination.

For example, in the case of people with disabilities, more unequal behaviours are developed against severe disabilities, as well as the most visible disabilities, which

can challenge to a great extent the dominant aesthetics of society. The same applies to the good use of the Greek language. An immigrant woman mentioned: "When you were in the house, you felt some joy…, but when you shut the door and you went out, there was an invisible wall that warned you 'mind how you talk' for people not to understand that you are from Albania, and from then on, all day long I was in distress".

In the recent times of financial crisis, discrimination has increased more, especially in the workplace and in the public sector. People seem to no longer be able to manage diversity because of the psychological exhaustion caused by the crisis. Especially in the workplace, the wider society feels competitive against the six groups under study, considers them to be inferior and, therefore, less worthy of having a job in a society with high unemployment rates, where the majority of the general population cannot find a job. There is also criticism from the general population regarding benefit policies for these groups, which raises even more discrimination and racist attitudes.

## C.4 Causes and effects of multiple discrimination

The identification of the causes of multiple discrimination takes place primarily and mainly through the general causes of discrimination. All the interviewees point out that there are prejudices and stereotypes regarding the six grounds from the general population. The more an individual differs from the perceived "norm", the more vulnerable the individual could be to multiple discrimination. As a gay man mentions "There is prejudice in the Greek society for anything different; nation, religion and family are the triptych of conservatism that prevails in society".

Discrimination and its impact are evident in all target groups, but result from different attitudes and prejudices. For people with disabilities, discrimination mainly stems from a sense of pity and superiority towards them, while for LGBT people, as well as for immigrants, there is hatred and aggression. The stereotypes and prejudices of society towards the six target-groups do not allow and often prohibit these individuals from maintaining their place in collective life, which results in psychological consequences, such as anxiety and anger, frustration of isolation and alienation. An immigrant with disability reports that: "The first time you come out, you are treated with racism, then you try a second time, the same, and the third time is even worse…

Finally, you decide to get isolated… to stay at home". Moreover, exclusion from work can lead to poverty, since vulnerable groups remain unemployed in the long run, while at the same time they need additional health and social services. Their gradual dependence on social welfare services, as well as on their families and friends, is slowly leading to exclusion from collective social life and marginalization.

## C.5 Addressing and tackling multiple discrimination

Finally, target groups do not know their rights enough or nearly enough. For this reason, in some interviews, the interviewee was unaware that what he/she described was discrimination, much more when it comes to multiple discrimination. In the cases of being aware of unequal treatment, target groups do not report the incidents of discrimination, either because they believe they will not find justice, for example with the competent authorities (Courts), or because they are afraid that they will "get more involved", for example, with the Police, spending at the same time money they do not have. Some of them believe that reporting the incidence will not relieve the psychological pressure they have faced as victims of discrimination. The statement "I will not find justice", demonstrating the lack of a rule of law that protects the rights of vulnerable groups, is very often mentioned during the interviews.

In the LGBT community, non-reporting of discrimination incidents or even racist crimes is a common phenomenon. In many cases the victims are afraid to reveal their sexual orientation. In the cases of immigrants, they are afraid that the accusation may turn against them in the end, and that they may lose their jobs or even their shelter. Finally, many immigrants have faced severe discrimination which in some cases had led to violence and have not reacted. A black woman points out: "If they offend me verbally, I do not mind; only if they attack me physically, I will take action". More generally, there is a high level of tolerance and limited resistance to discrimination.

This situation gets worse due to the organisation and operation of NGOs. While there is a plurality of advocacy organizations and relative supporting NGOs, competition between them and scattered resources prevent them from substantially supporting the victims of discrimination.

Regarding the victims of discrimination, a gay man mentions that they deny reporting incidents of discrimination: "Most of them are keeping the problem to themselves,

and in the end this leads them to extreme situations ... suicides ... alienation. Anyone who gets hurt and knows he cannot find justice or thinks that he cannot be accepted, can very easily be led to loneliness and exclusion".

## D. Policy Recommendation and Suggestions

Based on the above findings of the field research, the following policy proposals for tackling multiple discrimination have been identified. Some of them concern discrimination on a single ground and some on multiple grounds.

- **Policies and mechanisms**

- Creation of a guide for the public sector with services' rules for target groups vulnerable to discrimination, in order to limit the uncontrolled individual behaviour of civil servants.

- Establishment of a support mechanism to facilitate victims' access to justice and reporting cases of (multiple) discrimination.

- Implementation of a "two-way" strategy in public policies, i.e. horizontal integration of a distinction between all policies and practices and the development of targeted initiatives addressing the most vulnerable groups that face multiple discrimination. In the latter, it must be prioritizing the ground of poverty in the general context of anti-discrimination policies.

- Support to non-governmental organizations dealing exclusively with the most vulnerable multi- discriminated groups. Supporting the development of networks and cooperation between different NGOs, representing a single ground for better understanding and protection of the victims of multiple discrimination.

- **Changing attitudes and fighting stereotypes**

- Education and training of civil servants throughout the hierarchy in order to familiarize themselves with "heterogeneity" and the needs of vulnerable groups, to understand the phenomenon of discrimination and, in particular, of multiple discrimination. Special training should be focused on the civil servants who come into daily contact with these target groups, so as to recognize what multiple discrimination is and how it is handled.

- Giving emphasis to the important role of school in shaping perceptions of identity and how we see others and ourselves. In this

context, educational programmes could be developed, which will familiarize pre-school and school age students with diversity. As it was mentioned by a woman with a disability: "Education is not a pill you take or a book that you read; education is something that you experience in your everyday life. If you do not have collegial feelings towards your classmate who is black, gay, lesbian, trans, if you do not emotionally support him/her and make him/her member of a team during the school break, no matter what he/she learns from the books, discrimination will exist".

- Campaigns to inform and raise awareness for the victims of multiple discrimination and for the vulnerable groups about their rights and the relevant legislation of their protection.

- **Research and data collection**

- Creation of a database for rights' awareness and reporting incidents of discrimination, as well as for regular data collection by bottom-up mechanisms that will allow detection and recording of (multiple) discrimination.

## Bibliography

Bryman, Alan(2008): *Social Research methods*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Denscombe, Martin (2006): *The Good research guide. For small-scale social research projects*. Berkshire: Open University Press.

Chopin, Isabelle, Farkas, Lilla, Germaine Catharina, (2014):*Ethnic Origin and Disability Data Collection in Europe: Measuring Inequality—Combating Discrimination*.Open Society Foundations.

ECRI (European Commission against Racism and Intolerance) (2015), Report for Greece. Council of Europe.

European Commission (2007*), Tackling Multiple Discrimination Practices, policies and laws*.

European network of legal experts in gender equality and non-discrimination ( 2016), *Intersectional discrimination in EU gender equality and non-discrimination law,* Directorate-General for Justice and Consumers

Eurobarometer 86, November 2016. Public Opinion in the European Union. Brussels: European Commission.

ELIAMEP (Hellenic Foundation for European and Foreigner policy) (2012), *Migration in Greece: Recent Developments*. Report prepared for the OECD Network of International Migration Experts (Ed).  European University Institute.

Expert group on gender equality, social inclusion, health and long-term care (EGGSI)) (2008), *Ethnic minority and Roma women in Europe: A case for gender equality.*

Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (2008), UN

Convention of the elimination of all forms of discrimination against women, (1979), UN

FRA EU-MIDIS Data in Focus Report (2010), Multiple Discrimination

*Global Attitudes Survey* (2016). Pew Research Centre- Global Attitudes and Trends (Ed).  USA.

Gazakis, Antonis, Sirri, Despoina, Takis, Antreas (2014) : *Racism and discrimination in Greece today.* Thessaloniki: Heinrich-Böll-Stiftung.

Magoulios, George, Trichopoulou Anna (2012):  «Employment status for people with disabilities in Greece. In*South-Eastern Europe Journal of Economics* 1, p.  25-40.

Kofinis,Stergios (2011) : «The Status of Muslim Minority Women in Greece: Second Class European Citizens?». In: Schiek Dagmar and  Lawson Anna  (Ed ): *European Union Non-Discrimination Law and Intersectionality: Investigating the triangle of racial, gender and disability discrimination*.Burlington: Ashgate.

Pavlou,  Miltos(2009):*Homophobia  in  Greece,  Love  for  equality*,*Country  report-Greece.* Athens: Institute of Rights Equality and Diversity ( I-RED).

Sheppard, Colleen (2011): *Multiple Discrimination in the World of Work*.
International Labour Organization, Global Report on Equality at Work.

Tsiganou, Joanna, Balourdos, Dionyssis (Ed) (2015) : *Combating Discrimination in the  Field  of  Entrepreneurship:  Women  and  Young  Roma  and  Muslim, Immigrants*.Athens:Papazisis.

# Appendix

## **<u>Interview structure</u>**

    1.   With which identities/roles do you identify yourself?

**Prompt:**Gender, sexual orientation, ethnicity / race, age, religion, social class (poverty).

2. Have you ever been discriminated against?

**Prompt**: multiple discrimination, description of the two most important cases (when, who, by whom, in what fields - health, justice, education ... - based on which identities?)

3. What types of multiple discrimination have you faced?

**Prompt**: direct / indirect - addictive / cumulative - harassment

4. For which reason do you think that you have been multiple discriminated?

**Prompt**:prejudices-stereotypes-existing rules.

5. How did you face multiple discrimination?

**Prompt**: address / not address (knowledge / non-knowledge of support organizations / legislation), informal / formal (supportive organizations / courts / complaints).

6. What role did your financial situation and your social position play in manifestation and in addressing multiple discrimination?

**Prompt**: income - social networks - position status - occupation in relation to the field of multiple discrimination

7. Have multiple discrimination affected your life to date?

**Prompt**: Impact: how and where (work, public relations, social life, personal life, exclusion)

8. What solutions do you propose for tackling multiple discrimination?

**Prompt**: institutional changes (public sector: charter of rights, change of attitudes and mentality of civil servants ...) mobilization and organization of victims, activation of citizens, legislation empowerment.

9. Do you know others who have faced multiple discrimination?

**Prompt**: Brief description of the case

# Interview list

| a/a | Description | Date | Mean | Recording |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1. | Male with disability over 45 years, mobility problems - University studies | 10/02/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 2. | Homosexual under 35 years old-Layer | 14/02/2017 | Skype | Y |
| 3. | Homosexual over 50 years old-doctor | 21/02/2017 | Skype | Y |
| 4. | Female immigrant from Bulgaria aged over 50 years old , secondary education | 17/02/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 5. | Female (Egypt) with Greek nationality under 35 years of age, technological education | 17/02/2017 | Skype | Y |
| 6. | Female Albanian expatriate over 50 years old with university studies | 4/3/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 7. | Female Greek Muslim (Muslim minority of Thrace) over 50 years old, graduate of primary school | 10/03/2017 | Meeting | Y with notes - poor voice recording |
| 8. | Female black with Greek nationality over 50 years old, graduate of primary school | 5/3/2017 | Meeting | N |
| 9. | Female black with Greek nationality under 35, secondary education | 5/3/2017 | Meeting | N |
| 10. | Female transsexual with university studies, young | 22/03/2017 | Skype | Y |
| 11. | Female transsexual with university studies, young | 25/03/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 12.(double) | 2 male homosexuals ( one black - one white with mental illness – both younger than 30 years old, university studies | 25/03/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 13. | Op. Cit. | | | Y |
| 14. | Man with disability over 50 years old, mobility problems, university studies | 21/04/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 15. | Female blind Albanian, graduate of primary school, under 35 years old | 3/05/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 16. | Female Greek woman blind over 50 years old, graduate of primary school | 3/05/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 17. | Female Greek blind and deaf, over 45 years old, graduate of | 3/05/2017 | Meeting | Y |

| | primary school | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| 18. | Female Greek woman with disability, under 40 years old, mobility problems - university studies | 4/05/2017 | Skype | Y |
| 19.(double) | Russian women, one under the age of 35 and one over 55 years old, graduates of primary school | 10/05/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 20. | Op.Cit | | | Y |
| 21. | Immigrant from Afghanistan, over 50 years old, without education | 10/05/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 22. | Egyptian woman with health problems over 50 years old with university studies | 10/05/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 23. | Pakistani over 50 years old, Muslim, with university studies | 01/06/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 24. | Moldovan with disability, less than 40 years old with university studies | 8/6/2017 | Skype | Y |
| 25. | ROMA Albanian, less than 30 years old, literate | 16/06/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 26. | ROMA woman under 35 years old with university education | 27/06/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 27. | Black woman under 35 years old without education | 10/07/2019 | Meeting | Y with notes - poor voice recording |
| 28. | Greek woman older than 50 years old without education | 12/07/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 29. | Greek woman under 35 years old with chronic disease | 27/07/2017 | Skype | Y |
| 30. | ROMA from Romania under 35 years old with university studies | 27/07/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 31. | Expatriated Albanian woman with university studies | 28/07/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 32.(double) | Pakistani youth without education (illegal immigrants) | 03/08/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 33 | Op. Cit | | Meeting | Y |
| 34 | Ukrainian young immigrant woman, secondary education | 03/08/2017 | Meeting | Y |
| 35 (double) | Greek women aged over 45 years old , one woman with university studies and the other woman graduated of secondary school | 4/08/2017 | Meeting | N |
| 36 | Op. Cit | | | |

## **Introduction letter (accompanied document with the interview)**

Project Logo

Dear Sir / Madam,                                                    Date ……..

Within the framework of the European research project "Tackling multiple discrimination in Greece", the National Center for Social Research, as Project Coordinator, conducts a series of interviews and questionnaires to study multiple discrimination in vulnerable population groups. By "multiple discrimination" we refer to the notion of discrimination for more than one reason (sex, race, ethnicity, age, sexual preference, religion, poverty, etc.) in any given situation or time (definition according to the Fundamental Rights Agency Rights of the European Union (FRA).

The purpose of this research is to identify the reasons, areas and implications of multiple discrimination for a. making proposals to improve the institutional framework b. changing the attitudes of civil servants on multiple discrimination; and c. increasing awareness raising.

This project, which lasts for two years, will significantly contribute to the emergence and analysis of multiple discrimination, a phenomenon that has not been adequately and systematically studied in Greece and effectively addressed by the public sector. For this reason, we appreciate your participation as extremely important since you will transfer to us your experiences and the way you have faced (multiple) discrimination,

This research respects the principles of confidentiality and confidentiality: Your full name, like all other personal information, will remain anonymous and will not be used and / or published under it. After the end of the project, the recording of the interview (if you approve it in the first phase) and any interview notes used to record the results will be destroyed. Wherever you want, you have the possibility not answer a question and / or stop the whole interview.

If you have any additional questions, please contact the scientific manager of the project Mr. Dionisis Balourdo, Research Director of EKKE, tel 210-7491693 and e-mail: dbalourdos@ekke.gr or alternatively to the scientific associate of EKKE with whom you will conduct and this interview, Ms. Despina Grigoriadou at tel: 6941690077 and e-mail: des_grigoriadou@hotmail.com.

Thank you in advance for your cooperation.

The scientific manager of the project

D. Balourdos

EU flag

The project is co - funded (80%) by the Rights, Equality and Citizenship (REC) Programme of the European Union